

**UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS  
FOR THE SIXTH CIRCUIT**

Kelly L. Stephens  
Clerk

100 EAST FIFTH STREET, ROOM 540  
POTTER STEWART U.S. COURTHOUSE  
CINCINNATI, OHIO 45202-3988

Tel. (513) 564-7000  
[www.ca6.uscourts.gov](http://www.ca6.uscourts.gov)

Filed: November 01, 2024

Mr. John J. Bursch  
Alliance Defending Freedom  
440 First Street, N.W.  
Suite 600  
Washington, DC 20001

Mr. Talmadge Butts  
Foundation for Moral Law  
Senior Counsel  
1 Dexter Avenue  
Montgomery, AL 36104

Mr. David Joseph Carey  
American Civil Liberties Union of Ohio Foundation  
1108 City Park Avenue, Suite 203  
Columbus, OH 43206

Mr. John Michael Connolly  
Consovoy McCarthy  
1600 Wilson Boulevard  
Suite 700  
Arlington, VA 22209

Ms. Deborah Jane Dewart  
111 Magnolia Lane  
Hubert, NC 28539

Mr. Steven W. Fitschen  
National Legal Foundation  
524 Johnstown Road  
Chesapeake, VA 23322

Mr. Bartholomew Thomas Freeze  
Freund, Freeze & Arnold  
88 E. Broad Street, Suite 875  
Columbus, OH 43215

Ms. Amy Gilbert  
ACLU of Ohio Foundation  
4506 Chester Avenue  
Cleveland, OH 44103

Mr. Paul Giorgianni  
Giorgianni Law  
1538 Arlington Avenue  
Columbus, OH 43212-2710

Mr. James Hasson  
Consovoy McCarthy  
1600 Wilson Boulevard  
Suite 700  
Arlington, VA 22209

Mr. Mark P. Herron  
5001 Mayfield Road  
Suite 318  
Lyndhurst, OH 44124

Ms. Genevieve Marie Hoffman  
Freund, Freeze & Arnold  
88 E. Broad Street  
Suite 875  
Columbus, OH 43215

Mr. Mathew Hoffmann  
Alliance Defending Freedom  
44180 Riverside Parkway  
Lansdowne, VA 20176

Mr. Benjamin Isgur  
560 W. Crossville Road  
Suite 104  
Roswell, GA 30075

Mr. Tyson Charles Langhofer  
Alliance Defending Freedom  
44180 Riverside Parkway  
Lansdowne, VA 20176

Ms. Freda Levenson  
ACLU of Ohio Foundation  
4506 Chester Avenue  
Cleveland, OH 44103

Mr. Ronald Gary London  
Foundation for Individual Rights in Education  
General Counsel  
700 Pennsylvania Avenue, S.E.  
Suite 340  
Washington, DC 20003

Ms. Sherrie Clayborne Massey  
Peters Kalail & Markakis  
6480 Rockside Woods Boulevard, S.  
Suite 300  
Cleveland, OH 44131-2222

Ms. Sandra R. McIntosh  
Scott Scriven  
250 E. Broad Street  
Suite 900  
Columbus, OH 43215

Ms. Taylor A.R. Meehan  
Convoy McCarthy  
1600 Wilson Boulevard  
Suite 700  
Arlington, VA 22209

Mr. Brett Robert Nolan  
Institute for Free Speech  
1150 Connecticut Avenue, N.W.  
Suite 801  
Washington, DC 20036

Mr. Cameron Thomas Norris  
Convoy McCarthy  
1600 Wilson Boulevard, Suite 700  
Arlington, VA 22209

Mr. Scott C. Peters  
Peters Kalail & Markakis  
6480 Rockside Woods Boulevard, S.  
Suite 300  
Cleveland, OH 44131-2222

Ms. Jessica Kathryn Philemond  
Scott Scriven  
250 E. Broad Street, Suite 900  
Columbus, OH 43215

Mr. Emmett Robinson  
Robinson Law Firm  
6600 Lorain Avenue  
Suite 731  
Cleveland, OH 44102

Mr. Adam Ezra Schulman  
Hamilton Lincoln Law Institute  
1629 K Street, N.W.  
Suite 300  
Washington, DC 20006

Mr. Ilya Shapiro  
Manhattan Institute  
52 Vanderbilt Avenue  
New York, NY 10017

Mr. Daniel Shisler  
Law Office  
167 White Pond Drive  
Akron, OH 44313

Mr. Joseph David Spate  
Office of the Attorney General  
of South Carolina  
P.O. Box 11549  
Columbia, SC 29211

Mr. Mitchell Stith  
Scott Scriven  
250 E. Broad Street  
Suite 900  
Columbus, OH 43215

Ms. Kayla Toney  
First Liberty Institute  
1331 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.  
Suite 1410  
Washington, DC 20004

Mr. Thomas Samuel Vaseliou  
Consovoy McCarthy  
1600 Wilson Boulevard, Suite 700  
Arlington, VA 22209

Re: Case No. 23-3630, *Parents Defending Education v. Olentangy Local School Dist, et al*  
Originating Case No. : 2:23-cv-01595

Dear Counsel,

The attached order designated for publication was filed today in this case.

Yours very truly,

Kelly L. Stephens, Clerk

Cathrynn Lovely, Opinions Deputy

cc: Mr. Richard W. Nagel

Enclosure

RECOMMENDED FOR PUBLICATION  
Pursuant to Sixth Circuit I.O.P. 32.1(b)

File Name: 24a0247p.06

**UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS**  
**FOR THE SIXTH CIRCUIT**

---

PARENTS DEFENDING EDUCATION,

*Plaintiff-Appellant,*

v.

OLENTANGY LOCAL SCHOOL DISTRICT BOARD OF EDUCATION; MARK T. RAIFF, in his official capacity as Superintendent of Olentangy Local School District; PETER STERN, in his official capacity as Olentangy's Assistant Director of Equity and Inclusion; RANDY WRIGHT, in his official capacity as Olentangy's Chief of Administrative Services; KEVIN DABERKOW, in his official capacity as a member of the Olentangy Board of Education; BRANDON LESTER, in his official capacity as a member of the Olentangy Board of Education; KEVIN O'BRIEN, in his official capacity as a member of the Olentangy Board of Education; LIBBY WALLICK, in her official capacity as a member of the Olentangy Board of Education; LAKESHA WYSE, in her official capacity as a member of the Olentangy Board of Education,

*Defendants-Appellees.*

No. 23-3630

On Petition for Rehearing En Banc.

United States District Court for the Southern District of Ohio at Columbus.

No. 2:23-cv-01595—Algenon L. Marbley, District Judge.

Decided and Filed: November 1, 2024

Before: SUTTON, Chief Judge; MOORE, CLAY, GRIFFIN, KETHLEDGE, STRANCH, THAPAR, BUSH, LARSEN, NALBANDIAN, READLER, MURPHY, DAVIS, MATHIS, BLOOMEKATZ, and RITZ, Circuit Judges.

No. 23-3630

*Parents Defending Educ. v. Olentangy  
Local Sch. Dist. Bd. of Educ.*

Page 2

---

**COUNSEL**

**ON PETITION FOR REHEARING EN BANC and REPLY:** J. Michael Connolly, Cameron T. Norris, Thomas S. Vaseliou, CONSOVOY MCCARTHY PLLC, Arlington, Virginia, for Appellant. **ON RESPONSE:** Bartholomew T. Freeze, Genevieve M. Hoffman, FREUND, FREEZE & ARNOLD, Columbus, Ohio, Jessica K. Philemond, Sandra R. McIntosh, Mitchell L. Stith, SCOTT SCRIVEN LLP, Columbus, Ohio, for Appellees. **ON BRIEF:** Joseph D. Spate, OFFICE OF THE ATTORNEY GENERAL OF SOUTH CAROLINA, Columbia, South Carolina, John J. Bursch, ALLIANCE DEFENDING FREEDOM, Washington, D.C., Tyson C. Langhofer, Mathew W. Hoffmann, ALLIANCE DEFENDING FREEDOM, Lansdowne, Virginia, Ilya Shapiro, MANHATTAN INSTITUTE, New York, New York, Kayla A. Toney, FIRST LIBERTY INSTITUTE, Washington, D.C., Adam E. Schulman, HAMILTON LINCOLN LAW INSTITUTE, Washington, D.C., Brett R. Nolan, INSTITUTE FOR FREE SPEECH, Washington, D.C., Talmadge Butts, FOUNDATION FOR MORAL LAW, Gallant, Alabama, for Amici Curiae.

---

---

**ORDER**

---

A majority of the Judges of this Court in regular active service has voted for rehearing en banc of this case. Under Sixth Circuit Rule 35(b), “[a] decision to grant rehearing en banc vacates the previous opinion and judgment of the court, stays the mandate, and restores the case on the docket as a pending appeal.”

Accordingly, it is ORDERED that the previous decision and judgment of this court are vacated, the mandate is stayed, and this case is restored to the docket as a pending appeal.

The Clerk will direct the parties to file supplemental briefs and will schedule this case for oral argument as soon as possible.

ENTERED BY ORDER OF THE COURT



---

Kelly L. Stephens, Clerk